

<https://doi.org/10.23913/ride.v14i27.1752>

Scientific articles

Una investigación sobre el desarrollo de la primera Orquesta Sinfónica Juvenil de Yucatán

***Research of the development of the first Yucatan Youth Symphony
Orchestra***

***Uma investigação sobre o desenvolvimento da primeira Orquestra Sinfônica
Juvenil de Yucatán***

Paulina Bautista Cupul

Universidad de las Artes de Yucatán, México

paulina.bautista@esay.edu.mx

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3705-1752?lang=en>

Edith J. Cisneros-Cohernour

Universidad Autónoma de Yucatán, México

ecohernour@gmail.com

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2319-1519>

Resumen

La Orquesta Sinfónica Juvenil de Yucatán nace por motivación de un grupo de jóvenes del estado, quienes crearon un vínculo emocional que no les permitió ser ajenos a su desarrollo histórico y musical, al cual se le pudo dar seguimiento a través de una investigación cualitativa más amplia relacionada con la implementación del Sistema en Yucatán. Por tanto, el propósito de este artículo es dar a conocer los aspectos que favorecieron su auge y permanencia durante 13 años pese a los cambios en su adscripción institucional, así como los determinantes para su cierre. Para esto, se llevaron a cabo 19 entrevistas en profundidad, revisión documental y observación participante durante los ensayos, conciertos, reuniones y actividades de la agrupación.

Los resultados muestran que antes de su adhesión a la versión yucateca de El Sistema, los jóvenes músicos desarrollaron un liderazgo compartido que los llevó a defender sus ideales

frente a las autoridades y durante su adscripción se identificaron cuatro áreas de fortalezas y tres de debilidades. Finalmente, en su última etapa de independencia la orquesta juvenil regresó a la inestabilidad de los servicios necesarios para su funcionamiento, tal como en sus inicios. Se concluye, por tanto, que el vaivén en la adscripción de la orquesta como resultado de los cambios políticos fueron determinantes para su supervivencia, en amalgama con el tipo de liderazgo ejercido por los directores y participantes claves, situación que se vuelve crítica ante la falta de investigaciones sobre los aspectos estructurales para armar una orquesta juvenil y las implicaciones para su desarrollo.

Palabras claves: agrupación musical, el sistema, jóvenes músicos, orquesta juvenil, orquesta sinfónica.

Abstract

The Orquesta Sinfónica Juvenil de Yucatán was created by a group of young individuals from within the state who developed an emotional bond in which they refused to ignore the historical and musical development that came before them. This historic musical development was followed by a broader qualitative investigation related to the implementation of El Sistema in Yucatan. The purpose of this article is to present the aspects that favored the rise and permanence of musical development for 13 years despite the changes to its institutional affiliation, as well as the determinants for its closure. Overall, 19 interviews were carried out, as well as documentary review and participant observation during the rehearsals, concerts, meetings, and activities of the group.

The results show that before their adherence to the Yucatecan adaptation of El Sistema, the young musicians developed a shared leadership that led them to defend their ideals from authorities figures. In their adherence to the program four areas of strengths and three areas of weakness were identified. Finally, in their last stage of independence, the youth orchestra returned to the instability of the services necessary for its operation, just as in its beginnings. In amalgamation with the leadership exercised by directors and key actors, paired with the lack of research on structural aspects of organizing a youth orchestra and the implications of its development, it is concluded that the political changes negatively impacted the survival of the orchestra.

Keywords: El Sistema, musical groups, symphonic orchestra, youth orchestra, young musicians.

Resumo

A Orquestra Sinfônica Juvenil de Yucatán nasceu da motivação de um grupo de jovens do estado, que criou um vínculo afetivo que não lhes permitiu ficar alheios ao seu desenvolvimento histórico e musical, que poderia ser acompanhado por meio de uma abordagem qualitativa mais ampla. investigação relacionada à implementação do Sistema em Yucatán. Portanto, o objetivo deste artigo é apresentar os aspectos que favoreceram sua ascensão e permanência por 13 anos apesar das mudanças em sua filiação institucional, bem como os determinantes para seu encerramento. Para isso, foram realizadas 19 entrevistas em profundidade, revisão documental e observação participante durante os ensaios, shows, reuniões e atividades do grupo.

Os resultados mostram que antes de aderirem ao sistema de Yucatán, os jovens músicos desenvolveram uma liderança partilhada que os levou a defender os seus ideais contra as autoridades. Além disso, na sua filiação ao sistema, foram identificadas quatro áreas de força e três áreas de fraqueza. Finalmente, na sua última fase de independência, a orquestra juvenil voltou à instabilidade dos serviços necessários ao seu funcionamento, tal como nos seus primórdios. Conclui-se, portanto, que a mudança na filiação da orquestra em decorrência das mudanças políticas foi decisiva para a sua sobrevivência, em amálgama com o tipo de liderança exercida pelos diretores e participantes-chave, situação que se torna crítica na ausência de investigação sobre os aspectos estruturais da constituição de uma orquestra juvenil e as implicações para o seu desenvolvimento.

Palavras-chave: grupo musical, sistema, jovens músicos, orquestra juvenil, orquestra sinfônica.

Fecha Recepción: Junio 2023

Fecha Aceptación: Noviembre 2023

Introduction

The Youth Symphony Orchestra is a musical group that is generally made up of young people in the process of academic-musical training, aged between 15 and 30 years. This characterization separates it from professional symphony orchestras, whose members usually have completed their studies at conservatories or higher-level institutions, hence the directors of those youth orchestras face the challenge not only of guaranteeing quality in musical execution and interpretation, but also to achieve a balance in the different levels of musical skill achieved by the members (Córdoba, 2018; Martínez, 2019). In addition, they face the musical-social implications, very present in Mexico due to the influence of the successful

Venezuelan model¹, which has been the subject of numerous studies and investigations that have studied the keys to its replication.

For example, in the case of the Mexican context, it is known that Fernando Lozano, upon returning from Venezuela in 1987, was impressed by the program known as “El Sistema” and by its founder, José Antonio Abreu. For this reason, he toured all the states of the Mexican Republic to evaluate the existing musical conditions that could support the promotion of children's and youth orchestras. Lozano found that cities like Veracruz and Monterrey already had youth orchestras operating successfully, and in other states there were wind bands and chamber orchestras (Morales, 2015). However, despite this background, the youth orchestral movement as a coordinated action in Mexico began in 1989 with the founding of the Orquestas y Coros Juveniles de la Ciudad de México program, which was later replaced by the Coros y Orquestas Juveniles de México, A. C.², and finally by the Sistema Nacional de Fomento Musical in 1996, which remains in force to this day.

All these programs were influenced by the ideals of the Venezuelan model, which generated various programs that seek community musical development through orchestras, bands, choirs, workshops, and other variants. These programs usually prioritize musico-social purposes, as well as more ambitious artistic projects, like those of the Orquesta Simón Bolívar de Venezuela, which involve an audition or selection of the best young musicians. In the Yucatecan context, the Orquesta Sinfónica Infantil de México is known for its annual call for auditions of children and young musicians from all over the country, where the best is selected during the summer.

Until October 2019, the Sistema Nacional de Fomento Musical had a record of 105 community musical groups, of which 28 were orchestras. However, despite the strengthening and multiplication of initiatives in the country, from children to pre-professional orchestras, the limited research carried out indicates that most of these proposals are still in the development stage (Bautista, 2016). Likewise, the lack of consolidated programs as organizational systems stands out, mainly due to political-administrative fluctuations. Even more worrying is the absence of longitudinal impact studies (Hernández, 2014). Therefore, the purpose of this article is to expose the factors that contributed to the rise and persistence

¹ El Sistema is the main reference when talking about children's and youth symphony orchestras; Its implementation is attributed to the field of musical training, as well as a tool for social transformation (Naranjo, 2016).

² By Fernando Lozano and Manuel de la Cera.

of the first Orquesta Sinfónica Juvenil de Yucatán (OSJY) for 13 years, despite changes in their institutional affiliation, as well as the determinants that led to their closure.

Methodology

Between July 2008 and August 2010, we developed a qualitative investigation in the Sistema Estatal de Orquestas Juveniles de Yucatán³(ORJUVE) based on the holistic, existentialist and constructivist perspective of Stake (2010). The objective was to understand the process of implementation of the program, as well as the historical and social situation of the participants, for which we collected information about the process of creation and development of the OSJY since 2005, as well as the strengths and weaknesses of the group two years after joining ORJUVE. In this sense, it should be noted that the OSJY, if it had continued, would have been 18 years old. However, in July 2018 it disintegrated. Therefore, we value the historical, political, and musical cultural management importance of analyzing its survival process, especially given the recent creation of new children's and youth groups in the state, as well as the context of institutional instability of similar groups at the national level.

The orchestra director, the assistant director, the orchestra coordinator, and 15 musicians participated in the analysis of aspects related to the OSJY during the period 2008-2010, with a total of 18 participants (6 women and 12 men) who were interviewed individually. In addition, informal conversations were held with other young musicians in the group.

On the other hand, various data collection techniques were used, such as participant observation in general rehearsals, concerts, training events, meetings of the members, as well as work and institutional meetings (recorded in the field diary and in audio recordings since July 2008). A documentary review was also carried out that included annual projects for financing the program, emails, official letters, schedules of activities, memoranda, web pages, concert promotions, hand programs and press. Finally, in 2020, an interview was carried out with the group's last director.

It is important to note that most participants held more than one role within ORJUVE, such as musical director and program director, coordinator and musician, instructor and

³ The existence of the program is attested to in the text of the Segundo Informe de Gobierno de Yucatán 2009.

OSJY musician⁴. These multifunctions gave them a more complete view of the dynamics of the group.

Likewise, documentary information, field diary notes, recordings and their transcriptions were organized as they were collected using the QST Nvivo 8 and 12 program. Through this program, discourse analysis was also carried out, the categorization process based on the strengths and weaknesses perceived by the participants, as well as other emerging themes, and the triangulation of evidence. In qualitative research, triangulation is a strategy to validate interpretations through the convergence of information (Carter *et al.*, 2014).

Regarding ethical aspects, participants were informed about the purpose of the study and the implications of each of the data collection techniques used, for which their informed consent was requested. All participants gave their approval, including the director of ORJUVE, who signed a responsive letter as general representative.

Historical development of the OSJY until its joining of the ORJUVE

In the state of Yucatán there is no evidence of Youth Symphony Orchestras before 2005, but presentations with symphony orchestras have been found since 1898, although they constitute isolated attempts due to their lack of consistency over time. It was not until 1925 that a more recurrent symphonic movement began, but always with prolonged periods of musical inactivity, such as the 25 years that followed the baton of Daniel Ayala Pérez in 1950 (Pool, March 1, 2023).

In the historical review of this period until the beginning of the 21st century, some relevant aspects were found to point out. Firstly, from 1936 to 1944, directors Samuel Martí (violinist and ethnomusicologist originally from Paso, Texas) and later Daniel Ayala Pérez (Yucatecan violinist and composer) prioritized the works of local and national composers in the repertoire of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán (the last one due to the influence of the ideals of his teacher Carlos Chávez). Secondly, most of the musicians were of local and national origin, with a minimum of foreign cases. Thirdly, the periods of inactivity of the orchestra are shown as a consequence of the retirement, mobility or resignation of its musical directors, which reflects that the corresponding governments did not have sufficient interest in the maintenance of the group, since they did not generate policies in favor of its

⁴ During the time of the research, Ph.D. Paulina Bautista Cupul carried out participant observation from these two roles.

preservation or, failing that, and despite good intentions, its validity depended on the flow of musicians or a musical director based in the capital of Merida, with the professional sufficiency to put together the repertoire (Yucatán Gobierno del Estado, s. f.).

In 2001, with the beginning of the new state government cabinet, the reconstitution of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán was proposed within the strategic plan for cultural dissemination⁵. For this purpose, a specific patronage was created that seems to have determined its validity to this day. The objective in this new stage of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán was to attract musicians of different nationalities, hence the call for its formation was made at an international level under the assumption that no musician would have privilege over the others; in other words, only their studies and skills would be considered.

In 2004, the project to reopen the orchestra had been launched, being the first in the state of an international nature. Its formation involved the arrival of 30 foreign musicians, among whom were Americans, Bulgarians, Russians, Colombians and English, as well as 14 nationals from various states in the interior of the republic, of which eight were Yucatecans. The chosen musicians would have as part of their contract to teach classes at the state's basic and technical schools: Centro de Iniciación Musical Infantil and Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas. Months later also at the Escuela Superior de Artes de Yucatán, as a policy to promote the musical training of new generations⁶.

Despite the musical relevance that these institutions gained with the symphonic movement, it was at the Centro Estatal de Bellas Artes (to date the only one in the state whose musical programs at a technical level are recognized by the Ministry of Public Education) where the first attempt to create a youth orchestra, since it is known that around 2002 the music direction of Bellas Artes, under the baton of maestro Fernando Cardeña Palomo, put its efforts into it. However, it was not possible due to lack of access to sheet music, musicians in the wind sections, as well as the lack of support from the general management to resolve insufficiencies in the material and personnel of props and rehearsal spaces.

In this context, the restart of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán, the pedagogical movement at the Centro de Iniciación Musical Infantil and Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas, as well as the attempts to create an orchestra in Bellas Artes and the attendance of Yucatecans at the Orquesta Sinfónica Infantil de México were aspects that little by little

⁵ As stated in the Diario Oficial del Gobierno del Estado de Yucatán del 24 de julio de 2004, pp. 64-66.

⁶ Mensaje político del C. Gobernador Patricio Patrón Laviada en el H. Congreso del Estado de Yucatán con motivo del tercer informe de gobierno. Julio 25, 2004.

aroused the interest of students to have a space to study and practice symphonic orchestral music (Yucatán Gobierno del Estado, 2007). This favored the creation of the OSJY at the beginning of 2005 by a group of young people led by a violinist, who a decade later would become the last director of the group, and who explained the circumstances that favored its creation:

Everything was happening. I was going to give a concert at the Mérida theater, me on the violin and another partner on the piano. So, the idea comes to me, and I ask him:

–Hey, if we have the theater, why don't we make it a little bigger?

–And how do we do it with the arrangements, with the music and all that? –told me–.

–Well, look, we can do a messianic music concert. I would make the arrangements.

And so, we invited about twelve colleagues to play. We gave the concert and then we sat down to talk, we thought why we don't make the orchestra part of José Jacinto Cuevas? but we saw that there were small problems, for example, not everyone was a student at the school, therefore, not everyone could use the rooms to study. However, I presented the proposal to the director and she told me that she was not interested at that time. So, I approached the coordinator of the workshops at the Centro Cultural Mejorada, I told him the idea of creating a youth orchestra, he replied that he thought it was good and that we should get together to talk about it.

From there, let's say that I started all the movement, it was natural, because I am more developed in that area, I think a little more about how to do it. Of the classmates, not all of them took a strong part, but they were always there in the activity, for example, if we had to come and put together scores, I would come and bring two or three of them with me.

Then, the coordinator of the Mejorada workshops asked me:

–Who is going to direct them?

–Well, now that we are going to grow, I don't know –in fact, in the first rehearsals he and I directed.

–Well, let me see if the director of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán can help us. Go talk to him! –told me–.

I saw the director of this orchestra at that time like, wow! You know, he was the initiator. I was a little scared, but in one of those I dared and told him. The first time, he told me: "Yes, but I cannot commit in any way to following the development, because I have many tasks." At that time, he was in charge of the symphony and several projects were being started in his department, in addition, he was also in charge of the Dirección de Música of the state, so I told him: "Well, it doesn't matter, let him help us at first and then we'll see how to do it".

And so, we invited our classmates to a rehearsal that was held for the first time at the Centro Cultural del Niño Yucateco in the multipurpose room, the director lent it to us. You can imagine... a total disaster, the scores were not complete, etc. But at least it helped us get started, there we were able to agree on the rehearsal days, which to this day remain the same days and the same hours. At the third rehearsal the director of the symphony approached me and said: "You know what? I'm very interested in the project. Why don't we make it bigger? Why don't we join CONACULTA so that they give us sheet music? So we called CONACULTA and we signed up for the project called Orquestas y Coros Juveniles de México, they invited us to Mexico City and as best we could we got tickets, they were very expensive.

I remember that the president of the symphony board gave us one ticket, the director of the symphony gave another, and the parents gave the rest. From there let's say that the orchestra's activity began to grow. Members leave, members enter, others go to study, others join, it is the movement that is being made (personal communication, June 4, 2010).

Once the group was formed, the support of the Instituto de Cultura de Yucatán was requested, which became tangible with the beginning of its activities on February 15th, 2005 in the facilities of the Mejorada Cultural Center (Uc, 2005). Thus, the group would be consolidated under the name of Orquesta Sinfónica Juvenil de Yucatán, made up of 41 young musicians (12 women and 29 men) between 12 and 25 years old. Since its inception, it joined to the Coordinación Nacional de Orquestas, which is why it was invited to participate in the Encuentro Nacional de Orquestas Juveniles in Chihuahua 2005, an event attended by twelve members, which made it until that moment the largest Yucatecan delegation attending those meetings.

The young people who made it up did not receive any financial or similar scholarships. The only practical benefit was having the experience of renowned music directors to teach them orchestral work. There were three directors of the orchestra before the creation of the ORJUVE: the first was a renowned director of orchestras and choirs⁷. Under his baton, three musical programs were presented, which helped the orchestra consolidate itself as an artistic group. Furthermore, it is known that their support was free as a collaboration for the betterment of young people. His retirement from the OSJY was due to rehearsal schedules no longer being compatible with his increasing responsibilities at the Dirección de Música of the state. Even so, he supported the search for a replacement for the group, he suggested a renowned Yucatecan violinist⁸ who had recently returned to live in Mérida; ensuring that he had an appropriate salary, which confirmed the government's support.

Thus, the second director began his work in April 2006, date on which twelve different repertoires were presented. In addition, he managed to bring together approximately 55 young musicians. His management was interrupted when at the beginning of January 2008, he was offered the baton of the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán. The young people said that this director was characterized by his discipline and demand for musical quality, which helped the orchestra to mature musically, thereby reaching a level of execution with which they felt satisfied.

The third director of the orchestra was a Yucatecan musician, composer, and researcher, who held the position from January to October 2008, in parallel with his role as director of José Jacinto Cuevas Music Center⁹. At the beginning of his direction, the young people recognized him positively as a musician and teacher, so they felt satisfied with the appointment. However, little by little a political and non-musical emphasis permeated his decisions, which was reflected in the absence of auditions to enter the orchestra, the low complexity of the selected repertoire and the low musical rigor of the rehearsal dynamics, which contrasted with the achievements of its predecessor. The breaking point was his intention to join the orchestra to the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas without first having discussed it with the members, since, as has been stated, the idea was discarded from the group's origins.

⁷ He studied at the Conservatorio Nacional de Música with Eduardo Díaz Muñoz and later at the conservatories of Milan and Vienna.

⁸ He studied at the Vienna Higher School of Music, an opportunity that allowed him to establish himself and develop professionally in that city, as well as in countries such as France and Spain.

⁹ He was director of the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas from 2007 to 2010.

Faced with the situation, the young founders asked the first director, who was still in charge of the Dirección de Música of the state, for help to inform the corresponding authorities of the purposes for which the group had been established¹⁰. Likewise, they asked the Secretary of Culture and the new director of the OSJY for a meeting to express their concerns. However, neither the voices of the members nor the written statement from the Director of Music to the Secretary of Culture (email, December 22, 2007) had any significance, which is why the change of affiliation of the OSJY to the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas was announced. The decisions of the authorities caused more than half of the members to leave the orchestra, with a balance of approximately fifteen members, who were still students of the center and were obliged to remain because of recently imposed academic regulations.

Finally, the young people triumphed by maintaining their absence as an act of disapproval, and in November 2008 the artistic direction was again awarded to the second director, who at that time was again able to accept the proposal. It was hoped that with his reassignment the level of the orchestra would be recovered; however, the structural circumstances of the OSJY would not be the same, since at the same time it was entrusted with the development of the ORJUVE project, to which the OSJY joined.

Before that, the orchestra had a certain independence, because although there was the figure of the musical director and significant infrastructure support, technical and operational staff of the Centro Cultural Mejorada, there were other aspects that the young people resolved such as the printing, reproduction and organization of sheet music, the development of musical arrangements, proposal of musical repertoire, communication of notices and other tasks. The participation of young people in these fundamental responsibilities for the functioning of the orchestra implied recognizing the importance of their collaboration, which promoted a synergy between them and the musical directors.

In January 2009, the group began a new stage by being subordinated to the ORJUVE structure. The accession was favored because the founding musicians, led by the young violinist, approved the purpose that the second director presented to them of the OSJY as a model for the four orchestras that would begin their formation in September 2009 based on the Venezuelan experience of El Sistema by José Abreu (field note, October 2, 2008). Thus,

¹⁰ With this purpose, the young people prepared a document that was delivered to the Secretary of Culture, with a copy to the Music Direction, where they established the objective, mission and vision of the orchestra, as well as a brief historical sketch of the reasons why they created it.

when the program evaluation proposal was presented, the analysis of the strengths and weaknesses that the members identified of the orchestra was considered relevant to take them into account in the development of the remaining four. The results are presented in the following two sections.

Strengths

The majority of the strengths identified were developed since the beginning of the group in 2005, with a minimum number derived from its incorporation into the program, which will be seen in the development of each of the four areas of strengths found: a) promotion of intrinsic motivation, b) factors that favor permanence and adaptation to the group, c) means for the practice and technical development of the instrument and d) improvement of the organization.

Promotion of intrinsic motivation

From its beginnings, one of the main reasons for the creation of the orchestra was the desire to have a space to play symphonic music, as seen in the following comments from the participants:

The strengths of the orchestra are its members because the guys who are playing do it because we want to learn... because we love music. My uncle once told me that when I started watching music only for the purpose of money, I would have lost the meaning of music, because I would only watch it for the money and I would no longer enjoy it, I see that the boys all enjoy... he sees that emotion in them (personal communication, April 14, 2010).

Let's put money aside... being in the OSJY makes me feel the type of music we play, because of the type of rhythm and melody, how it is transmitted from the percussion, how it is heard together with the brass and the same with the violins... it is surprising, you can imagine many things, that is what makes me most happy to be in the symphony (personal communication, April 15, 2010).

It is interesting to observe the emphasis on differentiating the impact of the economic stimulus¹¹ on their motivations, which clearly reflects the awareness in the enjoyment of

¹¹ What they began to perceive from the program.

orchestral musical practice, which also awakened the desire to fight for the maintenance or reproduction of the spaces where create these emotions:

I have been in the OSJY since it was formed, I am a founder... all my life I played in youth orchestras, in concerts; I made tours in some or several states of the republic. When I arrived here and saw that none of that existed, I was encouraged to participate along with a group of friends who wanted to play and were organizing an orchestra. I joined simply out of the desire to create an orchestra that did not exist here and that was going to allow me play (personal communication, April 12, 2010).

Factors that favor permanence and adaptation to the group

The founders of the orchestra created an emotional bond that did not allow them to be oblivious to the decisions, as well as the circumstances of their development, which is reflected in the analogy of one of them: "It's like having a child: you can't leave it, you started in the orchestra, you played its first concert!" This bond generated a commitment, a responsibility for vigilance and permanence, as evidenced in the following comment:

Another strength could be that many of us would not want the project to be destroyed, but rather to move forward, thinking that in one way or another, things will always improve... because I think that if the people who started the orchestra stop coming, the project can turn to another situation (personal communication, June 4, 2010).

Companionship and friendship it also favored adaptation, which developed from the dynamics of rehearsals, since during breaks the young people used to talk, practice some difficult passages, or organize to meet later; the same thing happened during the gatherings after the concerts¹². In this regard, studies indicate that one of the evolutionary tasks to achieve during this stage is to establish quality links with their peers, characterized by identity commitment, closeness and trust, links that can take the form of friendship (Berger, 2019), as reflected in their reflections:

The main thing is that in music I have been able to acquire real friends. At school, my classmates couldn't understand what my tastes were, they had parties, they went to "x" places... I preferred to go rehearse or play. Only in one place have they

¹² In schools and private institutions, musicians are usually rewarded with a snack at the end of the concert.

been able to understand me: in the orchestra, because they are all musicians and they understand my taste, they understand me, that's why I like it (personal communication, April 14, 2010).

Finally, the scholarship that they began to receive from the program allowed them to pay some expenses such as transportation, accessories, and repair of instruments, etc., which, in some cases, was a determining factor for staying:

The orchestra rehearsals and presentations took place on weekends, and I had to work in the mariachi, so it was either the mariachi or the orchestra, I decided to stay with the mariachi because I made a living there. I left the orchestra for a while until they called me to be an instructor (personal communication, April 22, 2010).

It was identified that the differences in the perception of the significance of the scholarship for their permanence were related to the amount, since those who were only members of the orchestra received \$1000 MX (roughly \$55 USD at the time) monthly and the instructors received twice as much.

Medium for practicing the musical instrument

The group represented for the majority the only space to explore the repertoire, the demands of orchestral practice (individual, sectional and orchestral tuning, musical sight reading, transportation of the score, among others) and the work dynamics, as explained a member: "I like to play and there are not many options, I would like to be an orchestra musician, then it is the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán or the OSJY, since I am not in the first, well that is what I have left, it doesn't bother me, it's fine" (personal communication, April 14, 2010). Another commented:

I have learned a lot from when I started until the end of this year. It has gone well for me but not everything was rosy, I got my scolding, it has helped me in what I play, and I have started to like classical music more, it is more technical study, embouchure, etc. (personal communication, May 16, 2010).

Half of the young people agreed that an attempt was made to promote their desire for instrumental improvement through the staging of different musical programs, with guests of international recognition, rehearsals during which they were motivated to study more disciplined to achieve better results and give a good impression on the audience. Finally, they considered that the orchestra was a complement to their musical training.

Organization improvement

The Orchestra Coordination was created with the beginning of ORJUVE. However, in the first year several personnel changes were made, mainly because it was realized that in order to be efficient in the position it was necessary to know the work dynamics of the orchestra, the sections that make it up, as well as master the musical language to knowing if the scores were complete, if they had any printing errors, how they should be reproduced to facilitate reading, if they were in the key of the existing instruments, etc. Little by little adjustments were made and finally from September 2009 to May 2010 a clear improvement in the organization was observed:

Many things have been improved in the Coordination of Orchestras, the organization, the delivery of folders, the control of attendance, being aware that they attend, speaking to them when there is something to inform them. I remember that before I found out because they were commenting that there was no rehearsal, also that they gave us loose sheets and they flew away. Now, it's about talking to them, informing them everything, having their scores, their folders ready. I like doing it, I like that they are happy that I have everything ready at the concerts, that they sit down and see that everything is well put together. When they come out, they tell you positive things, I like that, and it motivates me to continue doing things well (orchestra coordinator, personal communication, May 16, 2010).

However, when the coordinator left the position, instability began again.

Weaknesses

Three critical areas were found in the functioning of the orchestra: a) stagnation and neglect of musical quality, b) centralized decision making and c) non-significant scholarships for young people. Below are the weaknesses that were found within each one.

Table 1. Main weaknesses of the orchestra

Categories	Weaknesses
Stagnation and neglect of musical quality	Omission of auditions for entry to the orchestra and assignment of principals.
	Demotivation for personal study.
	Lack of positive competition.
	Lack of sectional essays.
Centralized decision making	Lack of inclusion of participants' perspectives.
	Distrust of young people to express themselves.
	Lack of reflection of the moments in which a decision was implemented.
	Uncertainty of activity programming.
	Disregard of the needs of young people as students.
	Ambiguity of the rules.
Non-significant scholarships for young people	Payment irregularity.
	Lack of other types of scholarships.

Source: self-made

It can be seen in Table 1 that the neglect of musical quality and centralized decision making had the greatest saturation of weaknesses. However, due to the length of this article, it is not possible to address each of them in detail, so what is essential for understanding the category is presented.

Stagnation and neglect of musical quality

Musical quality is one of the main characteristics of Venezuelan youth orchestras (Naranjo, 2016). However, the young people who had a longer stay in the orchestra perceived a stagnation in musical development, as the youth leader comments:

The orchestra has grown very slowly, I think that doesn't help... we have been there for five years, at this point we should have moved on to another level. In other places, youth orchestras are always youthful and stay the same as they start, but in our case, I think that the context allows the orchestra to do other things. We have the scores, we have the level of the teachers, we have the theaters, a quite adequate rehearsal space, we must have already grown much more than we are now! (personal communication, June 4, 2010).

The director of ORJUVE also reflected on this aspect:

We are not going to go beyond being a youth orchestra, that is very clear. But the Simón Bolívar of Venezuela is one of the most important orchestra in the world.

It is a youth orchestra, but it competes with the Vienna Symphony, with the Berlin Symphony, do you understand? It doesn't matter that we are young, we have to continue developing (field note, January 9, 2010).

Despite the director's vision, since the orchestra joined ORJUVE, no formal auditions were held for the entry of new elements, which caused significant technical deficiencies among the instrumentalists, especially in the case of the violins and cellos, such as a cellist expresses it: "As we are learning, there are things that we still cannot do, it is a very big weakness because you have the idea of how I am going to do this part... so I feel that the same thing happens to many" (personal communication, May 15, 2010). Given this problem, no actions were implemented to level or reinforce these new students; therefore, the lack of homogeneity at the technical level caused the pieces that were executed to be easy for some and difficult for others.

The lack of auditions was related to a political aspect of making room for anyone to meet many members, as suggested by one of El Sistema's philosophical approaches of turning orchestral movements into a "majority for majority" phenomenon. However, it did not seem to be understood or act in congruence with the strategic process to get there, which should not be minimized to a quantitative indicator such as the number of members of an orchestra. In this way, in the Venezuelan model there is a scaled orchestral system made up of orchestras of different levels that are accessed by demonstrating the required levels of execution through audition. Therefore, young musicians are provided with teachers of musical excellence that allow them to develop their skills, as well as strategies that ensure their motivation towards study (Verhagen et al., 2016).

In this regard, the members of the OSJY recognized the lack of personal study, while pointing out the same effect on their classmates: "Now there are no people who want to compete, who want to get ahead, there is no such need to improve" (personal communication, April 22, 2010). The director also expressed difficulties: "I still have many things with the program, the camerata, it doesn't give me time to prepare well" (field note, January 9, 2010). Regarding the demotivating circumstances, the young people suggested: "We have not encouraged positive competition, which leads us to more and not less, it is not about how many notes per second you play, but how beautifully you can play it" (personal communication, May 16, 2010).

A strategy proposed by the musicians to promote motivation was the promotion of positive competition through competitions for section principals, thereby highlighting the

importance of being carried out with clear and realistic criteria at the musical level of the members so that they are stimulating.

Things should not be manipulated, it is not “I’m going to give you a chance to occupy this chair.” I believe that things are not done that way, I believe that positive competition must be encouraged to fill positions. I think auditions should be held for instrument section principals, they should be asked often to play a piece of a certain level, it is not the same to demand that I want you to play the most difficult violin concerto! (personal communication, May 16, 2010).

The last weakness identified in this category was the lack of sectional trials, which were carried out sporadically, mainly due to the lack of an economic resource for the permanent hiring of specific teachers for their direction.

Centralized decision making

The participants expressed that they did not feel included in decision-making: “Now you no longer participate in decision-making. Now the maestro can decide for the orchestra because he is the director of the program” (personal communication, April 17, 2010). The situation generated discomfort for them, because in the first experience under his baton he used to consult the opinions of the young people, with which a shared feeling prevailed that he represented an element of growth for the orchestra, as one member says:

Now the orchestra has been managed for political reasons... I was not there when the orchestra was formed, but I know that it was the guys who wanted to play, then they forgot about the guys and now they hardly ask us what we want to play and that kind of thing, they just tell us they must do this and that's it! (personal communication, April 14, 2010).

In this way, from ORJUVE they perceived that instead of there being an intention to maintain the existing unity, the opposite was encouraged, which led to a fragmentation in communication with the director, a situation that they expressed to him less than a year after the implementation of the program:

In a meeting, a classmate raises his hand and comments: “I’m going to try to say what I think is happening (the boy begins to stutter), no, I don’t think I can.” Those present smile freely because they know the personality of their partner. The director continues with his speech.

Minutes later he raised his hand again: “I hope so now... I think, teacher, what happens is that we feel like the dad who works his ass off, but never asks his children how they feel and if what he does is what they need” (field note, May 30, 2009).

Another aspect that was evident was the haste and lack of reflection of different aspects such as musical, social, organizational, political and economic in decision making: “The quality of the orchestra, sound, tuning of certain instruments has been neglected, trying to fulfill certain activities, fulfill a certain repertoire, so decisions are made suddenly” (personal communication, April 17, 2010). The following fragment also illustrates the problem:

A week before today's concert, the orchestra coordinator was sent to review the conditions of the Tekit cathedral organ, as well as the space where the maestro wanted the orchestra to play. Upon returning to the office, she reported that the organ was broken, and the musicians were not playing in the upper part of the church. That same day, it was reported by the ICY that closed circuit was not authorized for the concert, nor audio, even so, it was decided to hold the concert in the church.

Consequently, there was no audio for the concert today and efforts were made to convince Tekit's father to lend his pipe organ. Finally, the concert was present, but all the technical problems raised at the beginning were not resolved due to the time constraints with which the concert was planned (field note, May 22, 2010).

In this way, lightness in decision-making did not allow us to compensate or foresee the disagreements or the possible consequences of the different aspects involved.

Other weaknesses have to do with the prevalence of uncertainty regarding the scheduling of the concerts, since, although after the implementation of the Coordination of Orchestras the schedule of activities was delivered, months later it was reported that it would not be provided again. Consequently, the members did not know the musical programming until they were informed a month or two weeks before the concert, which affected the organization with their personal activities. Musically, the lack of knowledge of the repertoire that was planned to be performed meant that the young people did not visualize the musical development that was intended to be achieved, which caused a lack of motivation to study.

Likewise, the problem had a political impact, since the authorities used to demand concerts according to the needs of entertaining certain events, without considering the

internal organization of the program. In fact, the management seemed to assume that as they were the ones who distributed the budget, they had this right.

Finally, the members agreed on the absence of an appropriate regulation to regulate sanctions, harmed by the classification of the members of the orchestra in different categories: those who did not receive a scholarship, those who received financial support of \$1000 pesos per month (55 USD) and the instructors, who received a remuneration of \$2000 pesos per month (110 USD), which generated ambiguity in the norms that were desired to be established for each group.

Non-significant scholarships for young people

The weakness of the scholarship consisted of its irregularity, since it depended largely on the political bureaucracy, which prevented its consolidation as an extrinsic motivator. The members indicated that they could offer other types of scholarships (non-financial) that were also attractive.

Regarding the strengths and weaknesses, the importance of consolidating the positive aspects identified since its implementation was suggested to the program: scholarships and the efficiency of the Orchestra Coordination. Likewise, ensure the maintenance of the strengths originated since its creation, considering that just because they existed, they would not last forever. Regarding the weaknesses, the need to draw improvement routes aimed at achieving long-term stability was noted.

D.C. to Coda

The OSJY continued under the direction of the renowned Yucatecan musician until December 2013, who presented his resignation as director of ORJUVE. In January 2014, a renowned Mexican pianist was appointed to replace him, who at the same time served as director of the Centro de Iniciación Musical Infantil and Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas, which is why he decided to delegate the musical direction of the different orchestras in the program. In the case of the OSJY, he decided to hire its founding leader first as coordinator and then as director¹³, since his role in the history of the group and his international experience in the field were valued¹⁴. Given the administrative transition of

¹³ The musician had retired as an ORJUVE instructor in July 2010 and as a member of the OSJY at the end of the same year due to disagreements with the direction of the program and the group.

¹⁴ In 2011 he participated with the Orquesta Sinfónica de la Unidad Académica de Música of the Universidad Autónoma de Zacatecas in the 59th edition of the European Youth Festival held in the

ORJUVE, the OSJY disintegrated, so the first task was to reconstitute it, since there were a series of concerts scheduled with the group (the closest was the concert on March 14 in the Feria Internacional de la Lectura Yucatán). In this regard, he commented:

Many boys who were in the OSJY were my students in Alborada (one of the núcleos of the ORJUVE), when I stay in the direction, they naturally return. Another group that I called was from the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas, there was a children's orchestra there, so I invited the most advanced ones. The third group were friends and acquaintances of mine, I asked them if they would like to participate and they were always willing, for me and because most of them were in the first generations of the OSJY. We were around 40 people, the repertoire was chamber: Haydn, Mozart, etc., pieces that did not have as much instrumentation. Later I invited them to continue, there were people who stayed, others who stopped attending and others who joined (personal communication, May 14, 2020).

After six months of not having support personnel to carry out their rehearsals, a Coordination of Orchestras, prop personnel and spaces to hold concerts at the Teatro Peón Contreras were formally appointed. However, at the beginning of November the youth leader decided to dispense with the Orchestra Coordination because the staff did not have mastery of musical language or general musical knowledge to resolve technical difficulties, which generated different errors that hindered rehearsals and organization:

The coordinator did not know about scores, she gave me poorly made scores, which I had to do again, it is not the same as giving poorly made scores to a group of ten teachers who correct it quickly, to me who was alone. So, I chose to take charge of the coordination.

On November 22th, 2015, the tenth anniversary of the group was celebrated, which was also the last as part of ORJUVE, as it would see its end at the end of that year due to lack of budget. The corresponding authority decided to fragment the parts that made it up towards institutions that could finance it. The youth leader was presented with two possibilities: joining the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas or the Dirección de Promoción Cultural. He opted for the latter as it allowed him to justify his responsibilities as conductor of the

city of Nerpelt, Belgium, where he obtained first place with *Suma Cum Laude*, in the Major Orchestras category. In that same year, he was invited to be the main violin in the recording of the pieces performed by order of the European Parliament.

orchestra. In this way, the OSJY regained its independence, but also the instability of the services necessary for its operation, just as in its beginnings.

I no longer had the infrastructure I had before, so how did I carry out the activities and concerts? For friends. For example, I needed something from the Centro de Música José Jacinto Cuevas, I spoke with the coordinator and since I got along very well with him, he made things easier for me. If I needed something from the Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán, I explained my situation and they supported me. So, although the theater and the press gave me, there were things that they no longer gave me. Before with ORJUVE I had a small budget to pay the musicians I needed, naturally after leaving us, that no longer existed. So, I began to invite people to direct, to teach classes, who because of me they supported me, but obviously there comes a time when this can no longer be sustained. I kept it up for about a year, coupled with the fact that my salary began to be delayed.

After the change of the director of Cultural Promotion in July 2016, the youth leader began to perceive a delay in his payment (it fluctuated between two and six months), which continued until his resignation. The situation worsened when in the summer of 2017 they announced that his salary would be cut in half.

The kids never really found out, I never told them anything about the administration, whether they paid me or not, I tried not to let them know, it didn't make sense to me, if I put money in for "x" thing, they didn't find out, they just came and helped me with whatever was needed.

Finally, the young musician was offered a job in the center of the country in January 2018 and given the situation of economic instability and lack of institutional support, he decided to leave the direction of the youth orchestra. There was an attempt by the head of the new department of the Orquestas Sinfónicas Infantiles y Juveniles de Yucatán to resume the work, but the members no longer responded to the call, thus the group saw its end.

In retrospect, he reflects on how the initial movement of the OSJY influenced his baton:

My way of thinking was that we had to do the job, I called all the kids and from before we began to put together the orchestra, for me it was always the social part, that they don't think that everything is going to be given to us, but that it is our project, they have to help arrange chairs, sheet music, many of them helped me make copies, put together... I delegated tasks to them. The clearest example was

my second violin principal —which earned it, because I auditioned all my principals. I told her: “This week we are going to see such a piece” and she would call the seconds one or two hours before the rehearsal and do her sectional. I gave them that opportunity because it was important to me that they feel that it was their project. If you remember, at first it was like this: we had nothing and we had to organize ourselves, they were things that I wanted to rescue. It helped me a lot, and although I did achieve many things, it was also a different generation, some things they felt they didn't have to do, why? because they were studying a degree, because they went to other spaces where they were given everything.

Another thing that worked was involving the parents, I worried about knowing why they were absent, how they were doing in school. For me it was the dynamic that I would have liked the orchestra to always have.

Discussion

When reviewing the history of the OSJY we discovered that although it was born with the naive desire of young people to have a space where they could play and improve in the interpretation of symphonic music, as well as enjoy coexistence with other kids with similar interests¹⁵, it ended being absorbed for five years of its history towards this magnet that is El Sistema, in its attempt at a Yucatecan version (Bautista, 2011).

Thus, for better and for worse¹⁶, it cannot be evaded as a reference, since it forces anyone who wishes to implement any of the different groups derived from its proposal to review the literature that documents it, that is, beyond the journalistic literature, which praises the achievements, but stops short of being critical of the aspects that must be rethought for their reproduction or adaptation¹⁷. Simply put, academic research should be consulted (Baker, 2016a).

The above would support those involved in its development to have a broad vision of the musical, social and human consequences in decision-making in a context like ours, that is, of instability, of lack of structures that provide important support in the survival of these

¹⁵ Determining aspects in the permanence, collaboration, and performance of the members throughout their existence.

¹⁶ Geoffrey Baker (2014), in his book *Orchestrating Venezuela's Youth*.

¹⁷ Work that has not been done due to the review of the documentation that supports the different programs derived from El Sistema in our country.

groups, as well as the dilemmas caused by the musical-social approach within a political sphere, which can be dangerous both musically and socially (Baker, 2016b).

As mentioned, most of the research on youth orchestras is linked to the Venezuelan model. However, it would be advisable to study more cases without such influence to detect general aspects of these groupings. For example, investigate whether there may be other approaches apart from the social-musician that are effective. Therefore, the case of the OSJY is relevant, as it shows a group that at one point in its history had an influence from El Sistema, but at two other times it did not. In this sense, the most determining aspects in its implementation in the Yucatecan context are presented.

First, recognize that to date there is no specific manual or “handbook”¹⁸ on how to make a youth orchestra. Studies are still scarce outside the context of El Sistema, but they highlight the importance of considering the constant mobility of its members and their heterogeneity in the levels of execution¹⁹ (Martínez, 2019). Given the constant challenges that this implies, they suggest the articulation of three parts: the row workshop, the sectional rehearsal and the general rehearsal, which must be directed by professionals or students who are sufficiently advanced to improve the technique, the tuning, the group sound, the analysis of the score, as well as to identify and adapt appropriate repertoire to the needs and interests of musical development, for which the figure of the arranger is fundamental in this work. Likewise, they highlight the role of the librarian due to its importance in searching for repertoire that can adjust to the characteristics of the corresponding OSJY (Córdoba, 2018).

In contrast, the history of the OSJY reveals that the only position contemplated for its operation was that of the musical director²⁰ and that although the figure of the orchestra coordinator was incorporated at different stages, the weaknesses in the musical language prevented its consolidation as a figure support. As for the rehearsals, the general rehearsals were the only ones that were considered indispensable in the work dynamic, while the sectional rehearsals were occasional, and the row rehearsals were much more spontaneous or

¹⁸ Generally, extensive scientific research on a topic result in the development of a “handbook” (manual or guide), which compiles and synthesizes all the findings on a topic to illustrate its status of study.

¹⁹ In this regard, one of the strategies of El Sistema is the creation of different versions of complexity of famous musical works until the execution of the original works is achieved (Verhagen et al., 2016).

²⁰ The functions of management, coordination, selection, adaptation and organization of the repertoire, row, sectional and general rehearsals cannot be centralized in its figure. However, it was identified that before and after ORJUVE the members of the orchestra compensated for the needs of musical arrangements, search and reproduction of scores, and work of the props staff.

at the will of their members²¹. Another figure that does not appear in the literature, but its organizational importance was evident in the Yucatecan case, was that of the props staff.

Secondly, the age range of the participants should not be forgotten, since up to the age of 18, children and young people have the constitutional obligation to attend basic education, a mandate that implies considering said academic responsibilities of the beneficiaries in the operation of any non-formal education program. Also, the importance of keeping track of participants who are pursuing formal music studies, if they are involved in other musical ensembles²² or continue their university studies.

If young people have decided that they will be musicians, they will emphasize everything related to it; but if not, completing school or other activities will mean that they constantly stop to value the time, effort, and benefits they gain by participating in the orchestra. For this reason, the directors had to pay special interest in knowing the musical interests of the young people, the aspects that motivated or discouraged their permanence or performance, their commitments outside the orchestra and the importance they had for them to generate relevant work dynamics and motivations.

The centralized decision-making, presented in certain periods of the OSJY, reflected overlooking these considerations, as well as the lack of a common vision in recognition that orchestras are organizations; therefore, it is essential to share a mission and vision that allows us to answer the following questions: Why do we exist? What do we work for?²³ Where are we going? (Carvajal and Melgarejo, 2011).

Third, there was a strong dependence between the survival of the orchestra and the energy, management skill and charisma of its leaders or conductors, implying that when its conductors: opted for better professional opportunities, they did not have anyone to replace them with the same tenacity or vision, decided to stop fighting or made personal mistakes

²¹ The participants were the ones who most demanded that these trials be carried out; by not doing so, they considered that the work in the general rehearsal was useless in certain programs, which generated demotivation because when they played the concert, they were aware that certain technical passages were not resolved (they were “muddy”). Some members of the line met to study, but since not all the members were present and since it was not constant, the progress was not significant for the purposes of the orchestral work. This reiterates the importance of achieving a balance of heterogeneities and the technical support necessary to achieve musical objectives and to foster positive motivation towards study.

²² In the Venezuelan model, the internal formation of ensembles is promoted, or sectional presentations (in the case of the winds as a wind band, and in the strings as chamber orchestra), since they recognize that they are a powerful strategy to refine technical aspects of the sections, as well as to satisfy more prominent aspects that favor personal study (Verhagen *et al.*, 2016)

²³ Hence the importance of El Sistema's famous motto, “Touch and fight,” which has evolved to “Touch, sing and fight” (Verhagen *et al.*, 2016).

that were discordant with the social values that were promoted that stripped them of their authority as leaders; the orchestra fragmented or disintegrated. The above is worrying because it reflects the weakness of the existing organizational structures and public policies to compensate for the fluctuations in the types of leadership exercised by its directors and participants. Furthermore, it confirms the importance of this relationship to deal with disagreements or development (Lozano, 2020).

Fourthly, in a state of instability in the financing of music programs, it is necessary to gain political favor and the mistake of prioritizing needs of this nature is often made. In this sense, the orchestra's reason for being is minimized to cover a cultural agenda of the government in power, without defending the need to attend to the musical development interests of the group and forgetting that if the expectations of training and enjoyment of young people are not fulfilled, they have no need to remain, as demonstrated by the entrances and exits of the participants. Therefore, a balance in both aspects is essential²⁴. Added to the above are the third and fourth aspects, which suggest that there was no political interest in consolidating its survival beyond the effort in which its leaders' put effort.

In short, this discussion closes by pointing out that one of the main limitations of this study —and that must be considered— was the impossibility of conducting interviews or focus groups with the participants of the OSJY in their last years, which would have enriched the analysis with the perceptions of different generations of members.

Conclusions

After reviewing the history of the OSJY and analyzing the testimonies of their first members, it can be concluded that some determining elements for the success of its initiation were the lack of a space to practice symphonic repertoire and the lack of an orchestral practice that would allow them to enjoy academic music. This shared desire united them as a group and led to the emergence of a leader, supported by the group to manage the necessary resources. Furthermore, the positive response of the musical authorities and their efforts facilitated its realization.

²⁴ During its history, the orchestra covered a very varied concerts agenda: cultural festivals, didactic concerts, solemn events, historical commemorations, tributes to illustrious people, pieces by novels composers; and also, collaborations with institutions with common projects (dance academies, choirs, soloists, educational projects, etc.). Professional orchestras are not intended for these purposes, although youth orchestras are. This, with a balance appropriate to the mission and vision of the youth orchestra, can be a great synergy.

Likewise, the survival of the orchestra was favored mainly by the commitment of the young pioneers, who defended the ideals that originated it. This was strengthened through links created through continuous reflections on its development and operational tasks, such as assembling furniture, photocopying sheet music, finding and planning, managing spaces and disseminating information. These activities promoted awareness of belonging and responsibility throughout their participation, which led them to occupy roles as instructors, coordinators, and directors in later stages.

Other influential factors included the camaraderie and friendship fostered by living together in rehearsals, sectionals, and concerts, since being young, enjoyment and a sense of belonging take on greater importance. The political skills of the directors to face the bureaucratic changes caused by political alterations were also highlighted, as well as their leadership and charisma to convene and maintain motivation in aspects such as repertoire, musical study, teamwork and active participation in tasks for the operation of the orchestra.

Finally, the lack of consolidation of the political structure for the financing of the OSJY, the absence of consideration and fight for the personnel necessary for its musical development and the promotion of a multipurpose worker instead a more specialized approach were identified as determinants for its decline. The lack of organizational models to deal with uncertainty and the neglect of authority and leadership practices that did not consider young people's long-term personal and musical motivations for belonging to the orchestra also contributed to its decline.

Future lines of research

The completion of this research has highlighted the importance of carrying out additional case studies on Mexican youth orchestras that have managed to maintain themselves for more than 10 years, since in this way the determining factors for their permanence in our context could be identified, as well as address challenges related to financing, personnel structure, leadership, motivation, repertoire, technical progress of members, among other aspects. Furthermore, there is a possibility of initiating research that encourages the development of these groups in a manner adapted to their own cultures and idiosyncrasies to achieve better development.

It is recommended, therefore, to carry out more detailed studies on the repertoire of youth orchestras with the aim of making a compilation based on levels of technical execution or identifying strategies that arrangers and directors of different youth orchestras have used

to adjust the repertoire to diversity in levels of execution, following the example of the Venezuelan model. In addition, longitudinal research on the academic impact is suggested, which allows us to understand the relationship between belonging to an orchestral group and school achievement, psychological factors, among others. These studies could justify the investment in this type of groups in the Mexican context.

Referencias

- Baker, G. (2014). *El Sistema. Orchestrating Venezuela's Youth*. Oxford University Press.
- Baker, G. (2016a). Antes de pasar página: conectando los mundos paralelos de El Sistema y la investigación crítica. *Revista Internacional de Educación Musical*, 4(1), 51–60. <https://doi.org/10.12967/riem-2016-4-p051-060>
- Baker, G. (2016b). Editorial introduction: El Sistema in critical perspective. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 15(1), 10–32. http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Baker15_1.pdf
- Bautista, P. (2011). *Música en el Mayab: un estudio de caso* (tesis de maestría). Universidad Autónoma de Yucatán.
- Bautista, P. (2016). Bandas juveniles musicales de Yucatán: los desafíos en la implementación de un programa músico-social. *Revista Internacional de Educación Musical*, 4, 61–73. <https://doi.org/10.12967/riem-2016-4-p061-073>
- Berger, C. (2019). El mundo social adolescente: una ventana de oportunidades para el desarrollo socioemocional y el bienestar. En UNICEF, *Infancia, adolescencia y juventud: Oportunidades claves para el desarrollo* (pp. 101-114). https://www.cippec.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/oportunidades_claves_para_el_desarrollo_web.pdf#page=103
- Carter, N., Bryant-Lukosius, D., DiCenso, A., Blythe, J. and Neville, A. J. (2014). The use of triangulation in qualitative research. *Oncology Nursing Forum*, 41(5), 545–547. doi:10.1188/14.onf.545-547
- Carvajal, B. y Melgarejo, I. (2011). Organizaciones inteligentes. El Sistema Nacional de Orquestas Juveniles e Infantiles de Venezuela. En L. J. Alvarado y R. Soria (eds.), *Estudios en las organizaciones públicas, privadas y sociales en América Latina y el Caribe* (pp. 109-129). Fondo Editorial UNERMB.
- Córdoba, J. (2018). *Repertorio para iniciación orquestal* (artículo para optar al título de

- maestría). Universidad EAFIT. <http://hdl.handle.net/10784/13058>
- Diario Oficial del Gobierno del Estado de Yucatán (24 de julio de 2004). *Programa estatal de cultura 2001-2007. Yucatán Gobierno del Estado*. http://www.yucatan.gob.mx/docs/diario_oficial/diarios/2004/2004-07-24.pdf
- Gobierno del Estado de Yucatán (2009). *Segundo Informe de Gobierno 2009. Texto del informe periodo de octubre 2008 a septiembre de 2009*. https://www.yucatan.gob.mx/docs/transparencia/informes/2007_2012/2do/texto_informe.pdf
- Hernández, J. L. (2014). *Las orquestas infantiles y juveniles de México inspiradas por El Sistema—legado, evolución y desafíos*. <https://joseherstrada.com/blogs/hernandez-estrada-blog/posts/las-orquestas-infantiles-y-juveniles-de-mexico-inspiradas-por-el-sistema-legado-evolucion-y-desafios>
- Lozano, F. (2020). *La importancia de las orquestas y la formación profesional de los jóvenes músicos en Puebla y México*. Seminario Internacional Concertante.
- Martínez, C. (2019). *Propuesta para planeación y realización de ensayos con orquestas infantiles y juveniles* (tesis de maestría). Universidad Nacional de Colombia. <https://repositorio.unal.edu.co/handle/unal/77207>
- Morales, W. (2015). *El acceso a la educación musical en comunidades en riesgo de exclusión social en México. Estudio sobre las orquestas infantiles y juveniles de los Núcleos Comunitarios de Aprendizaje Musical (NUCAM) inspiradas en el Sistema Nacional de Orquestas y Coros Juveniles e Infantiles de Venezuela* (tesis doctoral). Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona. <https://ddd.uab.cat/record/149394>
- Naranjo, F. J. R. (2016). Entrevista a Eduardo Méndez, director ejecutivo de la Fundación Musical Simón Bolívar. *Revista Internacional de Educación Musical*, 4(1), 47-50.
- Pool, M. (1 de marzo de 2023). Orquesta Sinfónica de Yucatán: 19 años de música, pasión y dedicación. *Peninsular Punto Medio*. <https://puntomedio.mx/orquesta-sinfonica-de-yucatan-19-anos-de-musica-pasion-y-dedicacion/>
- Stake, R. E. (2010). *Qualitative research: studying how things work*. The Guilford Press <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13398-014-0173-7.2>
- Uc, M. (2005). *Primer concierto. Orquesta Juvenil de Yucatán* (programa de mano). Instituto de Cultura de Yucatán.
- Verhagen, F., Panigada, L. y Morales, R. (2016). El Sistema Nacional de Orquestas y Coros Juveniles e Infantiles de Venezuela: un modelo pedagógico de inclusión social a través

de la excelencia musical. *Revista Internacional de Educación Musical*, 4(1), 35–46.

<https://doi.org/10.12967/riem-2016-4-p035-046>

Yucatán Gobierno del Estado (2007). *Mensaje político. Sexto informe de gobierno.*

https://www.yucatan.gob.mx/docs/transparencia/informes/2001_2007/6to/MENSAJE_POLITICO.PDF

Yucatán Gobierno del Estado (s. f). *La Orquesta Sinfónica.*

https://www.yucatan.gob.mx/?p=orquesta_sinfonic

Yucatán Tercer Informe de Gobierno (2004). *Mensaje político del c. Gobernador Patricio*

Patrón Laviada en el H. Congreso del Estado de Yucatán con motivo del tercer informe de gobierno julio 25, 2004.

https://www.yucatan.gob.mx/docs/transparencia/informes/2001_2007/3er/Mensaje_Politico_III.pdf

Contribution Role	Author(s)
Conceptualization	Paulina Bautista Cupul (main) Edith J. Cisneros- Cohernour
Methodology	Paulina Bautista Cupul (main) Edith J. Cisneros- Cohernour
Formal Analysis	Paulina Bautista Cupul
Investigation	Paulina Bautista Cupul
Data curation	Paulina Bautista Cupul
Writing - Preparation of the original draft	Paulina Bautista Cupul
Writing - Review and editing	Paulina Bautista Cupul (main) Edith J. Cisneros- Cohernour
Display	Paulina Bautista Cupul
Supervision	Paulina Bautista Cupul Edith J. Cisneros- Cohernour (main)
Project management	Paulina Bautista Cupul (main) Edith J. Cisneros- Cohernour