Evaluación de las competencias en el plan de estudios de tres licenciaturas en turismo en Puebla, México: Percepciones de los estudiantes

Assessing Competencies in the Bachelor in Tourism Curriculum in Puebla Mexico: Student Perspective

Avaliação das competências no currículo de três graus em turismo em Puebla, México: Percepções de estudantes

María José Contreras López
Colegio de Postgraduados-Campus Puebla, México
majo.contrerasl@hotmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3260-9246

José Pedro Juárez Sánchez*
Colegio de Postgraduados-Campus Puebla, México
pjuarez@colpos.mx
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8417-1752

Benito Ramírez Valverde
Colegio de Postgraduados-Campus Puebla, México
bramirez@colpos.mx
http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2482-5667

*Autor de correspondencia

Resumen
Teniendo en cuenta que las universidades se vinculan con el sector turístico a través de la formación de capital humano, el objetivo de esta investigación fue evaluar la percepción de estudiantes de la licenciatura en turismo de tres universidades del estado mexicano de Puebla sobre las competencias en su formación académica profesional y su relación con el mercado laboral. El estudio fue de corte transversal, se aplicaron 111 encuestas a estudiantes de dos universidades públicas y una privada.
En las universidades de estudio se fomenta el desarrollo fundamentalmente de las competencias del conocimiento del turismo, al igual que la atención al cliente y el trabajo en equipo. Por lo que es necesario fortalecer las competencias en las tecnologías de la información y la comunicación (TIC), la realización de eventos, la calidad en turismo y el idioma inglés. Aun así, se concluye que las competencias que adquirieron los estudiantes fueron satisfactorias para sus expectativas laborales.

**Palabras clave:** capital humano, desigualdad, política educativa, política turística.

**Abstract**

Having in mind that the universities are linked to the tourism sector through training and developing human capital, the objective of this research was to know the perception students in the major of tourism have towards the competences acquired and their relationship with the labor market of three universities in the state of Puebla. The study was transversal and a survey was applied to 111 students from the two public universities and a private one. In the studied universities the competences developed were in the area of knowledge about tourism, attention to the clients, and teamwork. It was found, however, that it is necessary to strengthen competences in ITC, organization of events, quality in tourism and the use of English language. Even so it can be concluded that the competences acquired by the students interviewed for this study satisfied the requirements of the labor field they should reach.

**Keywords:** human capital, inequality, touristic policy.

**Resumo**

Levando em conta que as universidades estão vinculadas ao setor de turismo através da formação de capital humano, o objetivo desta pesquisa foi avaliar a percepção de estudantes do curso de turismo de três universidades do estado mexicano de Puebla sobre as competências em sua formação. Formação acadêmica profissional e sua relação com o mercado de trabalho. O estudo foi transversal, 111 inquéritos foram aplicados a estudantes de duas universidades públicas e um privado. Nas universidades de estudo promove-se o desenvolvimento fundamentalmente das competições do conhecimento do turismo, como a atenção ao cliente e o trabalho em equipe.
Introduction

In the last decades on a global scale, strong social, economic and environmental problems are taking place, among others no less important. In the economic aspect, unemployment stands out around the world. In 2015, for example, the figure of 197.1 million people was reached in this situation, which meant 27 million more than in the years prior to the crisis, and was mainly concentrated in emerging countries. But people not only face problems of unemployment, but also of precariousness and low quality of work, because most of the contracts of those who have work lack guarantee in their conditions. In that sense, according to data from the International Labor Organization [ILO] (2016), more than 46% (1.5 billion) of jobs are of poor quality.

With regard to the tourism sector, this generates 1 in every 11 jobs in the world (World Tourism Organization [UNWTO], 2017). And as in the other sectors of the economy, the jobs it produces are aimed at people who lack specialized knowledge in tourism, mostly, and are hired for a fixed period of time and with low salaries. That is to say: most of the time they are precarious jobs. It is worth adding that this, in part, is explained by the promotion of flexibility or free labor market.

As is well known, Mexico does not escape the phenomenon of unemployment and job insecurity. From 2000 to 2010 the most affected were the professionals, whose level of unemployment increased 4.2%. The workers with higher average education, on the other hand, registered an unemployment increase of 3.8%; those with basic education have an increase of unemployment of 3.5%, and people without schooling an increase of 2.2% (Márquez, 2011). Despite these results, it is better to study what not to do, since professionals earn more income. Supporting the above, the Mexican Institute for Competitiveness, A. C. [IMCO] (2014) mentions
that the average monthly salaries in the country amounted to 4870 pesos; whereas the one of the professionals to 9981 pesos.

Returning to the generation of jobs in the tourism sector, in the fourth quarter of 2016 the employed population exceeded 3.9 million jobs and represented 8.4% of total employment (Secretariat of Tourism [Sectur], 2017). It can be said that these jobs are flexible and low level of training, since of the total jobs generated only 9% of those who occupied them had higher education (Méndez, Rodríguez, Osorio y Salgado, 2013).

Despite the fact that the tourism sector hires a small number of people of a higher level, the supply -license in tourism- of skilled labor continues to increase. In part, its growth is explained by the fact that governments consider that tourism contributes to the growth of local and national economies and promote tourism investment projects that promote the rapid expansion of the service industry (Dale and Robinson, 2001). But, according to the opinion of employers, skilled labor does not have the skills required by this sector. In studies carried out by the Research Center for Development AC [Cidac] (2014) and Camarena and Velarde (2010) it is mentioned that one of the causes why workers do not find employment -especially young people-, according to the Employers’ opinion responds that candidates for such positions do not meet or meet the standards of productivity, competitiveness and efficiency that they demand in the so-called knowledge society.

The objective of this research was to evaluate the perception of some students of the degree in tourism of three universities of the state of Puebla on their professional academic training and their relationship with the labor market. As a hypothesis, it is suggested that students from the oldest universities have a better perception of their academic training and that knowledge in tourism and a second language have a greater relationship with the labor market.

**Importance of labor competencies in the tourism sector**

In a global world, countries are required to be increasingly competitive; here the education sector, and especially higher education aimed at training qualified personnel, is a means to raise productivity and the development of a space (Peñaloza, Medina, Herrera and Vargas, 2011). The tourism sector is not the exception. Espasandín, Díaz and Quirós (2010) mention that higher education in tourism is undergoing a process of adaptation and change due to the new demands of
the labor market, the growing global competition and the continuous technological advances. Today it is considered that human capital is a fundamental factor for the development of this sector to be linked to the perception of the quality of the tourism product (Lillo, 2009) and to contribute to generate added value to the products and services provided to the client (García, Fernández and Moreno, 2013).

In conventional education it is expected that through the acquisition of knowledge and techniques, graduates in tourism will be sufficiently qualified to enter the labor market, and thereby establish the link between the educational and business system. But reality shows that the connection between the university and the labor sector is weak; In other words, the relationship between supply and demand of human resources is not as expected, a situation that marginalizes graduates from holding managerial positions. In the words of Herrero (2013), to overcome this dilemma, both systems should be associated and collaborate more. This implies that entrepreneurs must be linked in the design of the professional profile and the curriculum to ensure this correspondence between the educational and productive system. This will allow graduates to find work and entrepreneurs to benefit from hiring the human capital they need to be competitive (Damm y Szmulewicz, 2007).

Likewise, together with the business involvement in the curricular design, it is necessary to leave the conventional education system and move on to an innovative proposal, in which the student becomes the subject of learning; that guarantees their self-learning and this contributes to obtaining the necessary skills to undertake, innovate, change the interests of knowledge, interests to know more and more, as well as to promote solutions and to stand out in life (García, 2010). The change in the system of conventional education is justified in the fact that the work environment is demanding graduates a set of skills, abilities and attitudes complementary to their technical training. In this sense, Caravaca (1998) mentions that in the new model of capitalist-post-Fordist production, and especially in global cities, the level of qualification of the personnel required by transnational corporations increased. The tourist spaces in their search for competitiveness are not the exception and currently they are looking for highly qualified personnel. Faced with this situation, professional competences are relevant to facilitate the acquisition of practical knowledge and contribute to the autonomy to face a job (Clemente and Escribá, 2013). In short, it is necessary that through the study programs graduates of skills for the performance of professional activities
are trained (García and Pérez, 2009), contributing to increase the possibilities to enter the labor field (Freire, Tejeiro and Country, 2013).

Cárdenas and Pulido (2014) mention that competences encompass not only the skills required to perform a professional activity, but also a series of behaviors necessary to develop that profession. According to the ILO, the skills of graduates in tourism are the skills to carry out a successful work activity, a fundamental point that differentiates them from other degrees. Then, the value acquired by tourism graduates is the consolidation of the specific competencies that tourism service providers need and demand (García et al., 2013). This is the reason why professional competences are encouraged.

Without a doubt, the competences are not similar in the different professions, since these are grouped in technical knowledge and specific skills (Cano, 2005). It is also the case of the degrees that have as fundamental value the management, administration, direction and planning. These have as central axis the knowledge and mastery of the professional competences of the administration, only that in the case of the tourist administrators they have as an added the knowledge of the operation of the administration of tourist companies. This is to say that students acquire specific skills that are considered transcendental so they can be placed in a job and contribute to the achievement of the objectives of hotel and restaurant companies.

Following once again García et al. (2013), the competences that students must develop in tourism must be related to the profile of tourism companies, as well as the competence in management and management; competencies in planning, economics and finance; the ability to make strategic decisions; those knowledge related to the management of human resources and communication; knowledge of the processes and procedures of the different operational areas that make up a hotel; the command of languages, especially English, and that of information and communication technologies (ICT), as well as a strong orientation towards the client. Among all of them, however, the competences most demanded by employers are languages (García and Pérez, 2008).

With regard to generic competences, the ability to manage information, work in an interdisciplinary team, work in an international context, adapt to new situations and knowledge of other cultures and customs (Espasandin et al., 2010). With this profile, the professional would have a global and unified vision of the problem that surrounds the tourist phenomenon, and would play
the role of a trained researcher to analyze, interpret and assess the complex problem and its interactions (Andrés and García, 1995). It means that only in this way will graduates in tourism be able to achieve quick and timely results to be recognized and required by service providers.

In this way, the curricular design meets the needs demanded by the productive sector -tourism- to help reduce the imbalances between supply and demand of qualified human resources and convert their knowledge into labor competencies. Under this approach, in addition, each individual can have a better quality of life and companies increase their levels of competitiveness and productivity (Cinterfor, 1997).

However, it is necessary to bear in mind that university education is directed mainly towards the future performance of the profession and that training through higher education is a slow process. The relevance of this type of study is to help reduce one of the most frequent complaints among young professionals with respect to having ample knowledge, but they do not know how to use it in practical situations (Cordua, 2000). It also helps to combat disbelief in their own degree in tourism, as it is known that their higher education programs have little prestige and their graduates have little credibility in the Mexican labor market. (Gómez, 2010).

**Materials and methods**

The research work took as a unit of analysis the tourism students of the Madero University (UMAD), the Benemérita Autonomous University of Puebla (BUAP) and the Intercultural University of the State of Puebla (UIEP). The first belongs to the private educational sector, has an enrollment of 1242 students and the costs of studying the degree in question amount to about 18673 dollars. The BUAP, on the other hand, is a public school and, in 2013, it had an enrollment of 56,530 students. Finally, the UIEP is a small university that has around 214 students and also belongs to the system of public educational facilities in Mexico. In all of them, a degree in tourism is taught. The first two universities have a long history in the training of human resources and are located in the Metropolitan Area of Puebla, where cultural and city tourism predominates. In contrast, the UIEP is a recently created university that seeks to meet the university demand of the Sierra Nororiente of the state of Puebla. It is located in the municipality of Huehuetla, most of its
inhabitants are indigenous speakers of the Totonac language and present serious social problems, including poverty; in this region, the UIEP promotes rural tourism.

With respect to the curriculum of the degree in tourism in these universities, it can be said that they share the same subjects in a little more than 50%. In the tourism area, the courses include the administrative processes of tourism companies, as well as the domain of geography, theory and tourism typology: these are very similar in the UMAD and the BUAP. The UIEP, meanwhile, abounds a little more in the tourism directed to the rural spaces. On the other hand, there are important differences in the area of provision of tourist services - kitchen, restaurants, travel agencies, transportation, event organization. In this regard, he emphasizes that the UIEP almost does not attend this area. In terms of language learning, English is included in all three curricula, although UMAD also provides French and German courses. Finally, it is important to mention that the BUAP leans a little more for law and research classes and the UIEP for subjects to understand the physical environment in order to integrate their students into the community.

The difference in some areas of the study plans is specific to the training they seek at these universities: the UMAD (2015) ensures training professionals with a managerial and leadership profile to perform in companies, consortiums and organizations linked to tourism; The BUAP (2015) establishes in its educational model that it forms a person with knowledge, skills, attitudes and values, and that at the end of the degree can be incorporated into the hotel industry, restaurant, travel agencies and bars, as well as in all activities that they make up the tourism sector; the UIEP forms graduates with a strong community bond, strengthening the native language and culture with the aim of training professionals capable of building tourism development alternatives, either through the creation of companies or the management of tourism projects, as well as being used in the local tourism sector.

In the research, specialized bibliography on the competences with emphasis on tourism was selected. It is a cross-sectional study in which the deductive method was used, which establishes a link between theory and observation and allows to deduce, from the theory, the phenomena under observation (Dávila, 2006). The research was also based on the organizational culture concept of Cameron and Quinn (1999), based on the survey design model called the Values in Competition Model (CVF), and linked to 24 indicators and 8 roles that emphasize the spectrum of the administrator. In this study, the indicators were between 1 (very bad) and 5 (very good) for each
question indicating the level of agreement. The skills that were taken into account and that students should develop in tourism were both professionals (Tourism Area, Provision of Tourist Services, Preparation of Tourism Projects, Customer Service (quality), Events and Languages) and cross-cutting (Work in Equipment and ICT). To collect the information, the questionnaire technique was used and this was validated through a pilot test carried out in the BUAP. To interpret the information collected, it was divided into three groups made up of university students. The analysis of the information was carried out using parametric and non-parametric statistics. It is important to emphasize, finally, that in the analysis of the competences qualitative variables of ordinal type were handled to know the opinion of the students.

A census was conducted to calculate the sample size in the UMAD and UIEP. In the first, according to the Yearbook of Higher Education - Degree 2013-2014 of the National Association of Universities and Institutions of Higher Education [Anuies] (2014), speaking only of the undergraduate degree in study, there is a register of 41 students, and 32 students who attended the university were interviewed - it was not possible to interview people who had already graduated or who were not present at the time of the interview. In the UIEP, as it was said, a census was also carried out, that is to say, all the students of the tourism career were interviewed (15). Finally, the BUAP took as a sampling frame the number of students enrolled in the Degree in Tourism Administration of this university (1300) and the sample to be interviewed was calculated by qualitative sampling. The equation to estimate the sample size follows that presented in Gómez (1979) and is specified as follows:

\[
N = \frac{NZ^2_{\alpha/2} p_n q_n}{N d^2 + Z^2_{\alpha/2} p_n q_n}
\]

Where:

- \( N \) = Population size.
- \( Z_{\alpha/2} \) = Reliability.
- \( d \) = Precision.
- \( p_n \) = Proportion with the characteristic of interest.
- \( q_n \) = Proportion without interest characteristic.
The population was composed of 1300 students and there was a reliability of 90% \((Z_{\alpha/2} = 1.64)\). Considering the maximum variance, it was used to define the sample size the variable "Upon leaving the bachelor's degree, consider that you can find work in the tourism area" \((p_n = 0.5\) and \(q_n = 0.5)\). Substituting the values in the equation, the sample size was 64 students of the Tourism Administration Degree of the BUAP. In total, 111 students were interviewed: 64 in the BUAP, 32 in the UMAD and 15 in the UIEP.

**Results and Discussion**

With respect to the characteristics of the students interviewed, it was found that they had an average age of 20.9 years. When doing the comparison by sex, it was found that they do not present statistical difference \((t = 1.698, p = 0.092)\): men on average were 21.3 years old and women were 20.7 years old. Similarly, when performing an analysis of variance, no statistical difference was found \((F = 1.139, p = 0.256)\) in the age of the UMAD students \((21.2\) years), the BUAP \((20.7\) years) and the UIEP \((21\) years). It is noteworthy that this race has greater acceptance among women \((77.0\%)\) and is considered high if compared to higher education enrollment, where 50% corresponds to women, and for engineering graduates from the technological universities it was 39.6% (Presidency of the Republic, 2015). In a study carried out in 2003, in several Spanish universities that taught diploma courses in tourism, it is mentioned that this type of degree is mainly aimed at the female gender, since its graduates were 80% female (National Agency for Quality Assessment and Accreditation [Aneca], 2004).

Currently, the dimensions taken by the studies of the professions involve reviewing the development of human capital, not only in the need to train staff in terms of knowledge, but also in the skills that allow them to develop their talent and involve them in personal activities and professionals, as well as that, in parallel, affect the development of the economy and society (Peñaloza et al., 2011). In that sense, Freire et al. (2013) mention that professional competences play a transcendental role in the work performance and are the key to access the labor market. Here the students' perception of the competences involved in the Tourism Area was evaluated, that is, the knowledge they are acquiring regarding the administrative processes implemented in the tourism companies, as well as in the domain of geography, theory and typology of tourism, among other topics or courses that they have in their careers.
In this sense, high scores were found (4.1) with respect to the knowledge acquired in the Tourism Area by the students of the study universities. When performing an analysis of Kruskal Wallis, it was found that there is no statistical difference ($H = 1.50, p = 0.385$) in the competences acquired in this area between the UMAD (4.06), the BUAP (4.25) and the UIEP (4.13), since no variation was observed between the groups. By type of high school, no statistical difference was found ($H = 0.020, p = 0.871$) among students who came from public (4.19) and private (4.16) schools. It is important to point out that a percentage (more than 10%) of students are not acquiring the specialized knowledge of the area to perform adequately in the service sector.

On the other hand, the students interviewed in the area of Provision of Tourist Services-kitchen, restaurants, travel agencies, transportation, event organization-felt that they are not developing their skills as they wish: they reached 3.9 points. And although the UMAD and the UIEP concentrated the largest number of people who consider that they are not adequately developing these competences, no statistical difference was found ($H = 3.94, p = 0.104$) between universities. In a study entitled Alignment of study programs of tourism education to the needs of the labor field, conducted by the University La Salle (2012), it is mentioned that the training areas in which the graduate perceived to receive more instruction as part of their The program of studies was in tourism products and activities (with 70.8%), followed by accommodation-lodging and food and beverages. This result coincides with the perception of the students interviewed regarding the development of competences by area. This means that it is not only important to impart this type of competences, but also that one has to work in this area and improve the quality of the knowledge that is transmitted, since its development was not the most appropriate, since more than 26% of the interviewees failed to acquire this professional competence. This means that, since students do not adequately develop the mentioned competencies, it will be a factor for some hotel companies to prefer hiring other professionals, mainly those related to the accounting and financial areas, human resources, accountants, industrial psychologists and administrators. companies, and engineers and architects (OMT, 2009).

Regarding the Elaboration of Tourist Projects, according to the students, it was a competition between regular and good (3.8). In this competition, statistical difference was found ($H = 6.30, p = 0.027$) among universities: the UMAD reached the highest score (4.0), followed by the BUAP (3.8) and the lowest score (3.2) was found among the students of the UIEP; it means
that this last university is at a disadvantage in the development of this type of competences, which are considered important to generate profitable tourism projects from the economic, social and environmental point of view.

With regard to Quality, it should not be overlooked that it is fundamentally related to customer service. In this context, Fernández (2004) mentions that it is necessary to take into account, in the training of human resources, the ability to respond, professionalism, courtesy, credibility, safety, communication and understanding to the client. The opinion that the students have about the development of the competence of Quality in tourism was between good and regular when reaching a score of 3.9. Here, also by means of a Kruskal Wallis test, it was obtained that there is no statistical difference ($H = 1.87, p = 0.343$) between the UMAD (4.0), the BUAP (3.8) and the UIEP (3.8) in the perception of the development of this competition. Like the previous competitions, it was found that more than 30% of the interviewees said that they acquired it regularly or badly. As a result, efforts have to be redoubled, because this competence in the formation of human capital is essential to achieve consumer aspirations and, hence, the competitiveness of the tourism sector.

Regarding the development of competences in the area of Customer Service, it can be said that it is a basic competency that is associated with an infinity of professional profiles and, as a consequence, it is required in too many jobs (Santos, 2013). It is considered that it contributes to improve the relations with the user of tourist products and services through the knowledge and attention of their wishes and expectations. Among the students interviewed, it was found that they are developing it well (4.0). And similarly to the previous area, no statistical difference was found ($H = 2.25, p = 0.277$) between universities. In spite of this, it is considered that in this competition the students of the UMAD and the BUAP are better prepared compared to those of the UIEP. Another thing to note is that this competition was one of the most developed by the students; and it is cataloged in the Report of the design evaluation commission of the title of tourism degree of the Aneca (2004) as a specific competence to develop in the universities.

The Event Conducting competition, on the other hand, does not only include your organization; it also includes the realization of feasibility studies and the commercialization of spaces and services, among others. The results found indicate that the students in the sample are acquiring this competition between regular and good (3.8). Here we also found no statistical
difference (H = 3.29, p = 0.152) between universities. It is noteworthy, however, that more than 30% of students argued that they are not developing as they want. About the areas of training in which students perceive receiving more instruction as part of their study program were tourism products and activities (70%), food and lodging (68%), catering and food (59%); in contrast to planning and public management (31%), research and consulting (26%) and transport and logistics (14%). It can be said that these results do not contribute to the competitiveness of the tourism sector, since human capital is not being adequately prepared, and now it is required that it be highly trained, since we are facing a more experienced and demanding clientele.

Undoubtedly, as we have seen, one of the most valued skills in the tourism sector is languages. García and Pérez (2009) describe this competence as the ability to work in English as a foreign language, but also as the ability to communicate orally and in writing in a second foreign language. In a way, it is expected that the students of the career in tourism will dominate from one to two languages to be competitive and have a wide field of work. In the indicated universities they teach the English language; thus, 85.2% commented that they speak this language. Being more precise, those of the UMAD in their totality assured to speak the language; 87.7% in the BUAP, and 40% in the UIEP. As regards how well they speak this language, they are between regular and good (3.8). In this case, statistical difference was found (H = 3.33, p = 0.049) between the UMAD (4.1), the BUAP (3.7) and the UIEP (3.3). In this area, also, the UMAD highlighted, since the languages (English, French and German) are within the curriculum and drive them as a competence or strength of the degree. These results show that languages must be given greater importance as they are one of the competences that distinguish this type of degree; and because their learning entails being able to communicate with other people in a globalized world, since tourism is characterized by being present in most countries of the world. (See table 1),
Tabla 1. Tipo de competencias desarrolladas en las universidades de estudio

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competencia</th>
<th>Media General</th>
<th>UMAD Media</th>
<th>BUAP</th>
<th>UIEP</th>
<th>H</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Área de Turismo</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>4.06</td>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>0.385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Prestación de Servicios Turísticos</td>
<td>3.99</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>3.73</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>0.104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Elaboración de Proyectos Turísticos</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>3.89</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>6.30</td>
<td>0.0275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Calidad en Turismo</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>0.343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Atención al Cliente</td>
<td>4.08</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>3.73</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>0.277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Realización de Eventos</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>3.29</td>
<td>0.152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Idioma Inglés</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>0.0490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Trabajo en Equipo</td>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>3.93</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>0.484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. TIC</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>3.63</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluación general</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>3.99</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>23.06</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fuente: Elaboración propia

However, another type of skills to be developed by students are cross-cutting, such as working collaboratively and ICT. Being one of the keys to success in any company, teamwork is one of the most demanded competencies in the labor market, and not only consists of working together (Marcos, 2013). In general, it was found that in this area the students interviewed commented that the aspects involved are well developed (4.1). And there was no significant statistical difference (H = 1.17, p = 0.484) in the development of competencies in the area of Teamwork among universities. It can be concluded that this competence is developing well, but it is necessary to strengthen it, since 15% of the interviewees do not do it satisfactorily.

The competences in the area of ICT cover terms such as information technology, telematics and multimedia, as well as media and social and interpersonal interaction with technological supports that allow a connection. According to Castells and Hall (2001), productivity and competitiveness rest on the generation of new knowledge and access to adequate information, where ICTs are decisive for the processes and forms of the new economy, constituting the material
basis for the integration of productive processes on a global scale. Servon (2002) comments that their use means having the skills to know where and how to look for information and what to do with it, for the production of knowledge and the creation of content. Their development in professional training is important because of the role they play in different areas of the tourism sector.

According to the opinion of the interviewees, these can be classified as regular (3.5) and there was no statistical difference (H = 0.19; p = 0.899) between the UMAD (3.5), the BUAP (3.6) and the UIEP (3.6). It can be said, therefore, that the students interviewed do not adequately develop this competence, since 46.7% is developing it between regular and poor. The development of this type of competences is important due to the restructuring that exists in the tourism sector. As pointed out by Buhalis (1998), ICT allows tourism companies, mainly hotels, to develop alternative distribution channels to tour operators and have access to a large number of people, distributors and markets around the world without limits geographic. For all the above, without these skills the sector is left behind.

In general, it was found that the students of the BUAP and the UMAD are better developing the evaluated competences. This was verified, once again, by means of a Kruskal Wallis test, from which it was found that there is a statistical difference (H = 23.06, p = 0.001) between the universities. The BUAP and the UMAD present similarity, while the students of the UIEP present a minor acquisition of the evaluated competences. It can be concluded that it is necessary to prepare more students in the mentioned competences and that these results are similar to those found by the La Salle University (2012), where it is mentioned that the study programs are not generating competencies to encourage the creation of tourism products and the sustainable development of these, mainly due to deficiencies in the teaching-learning process of the contents and competences. It is also considered that teachers do not have sufficient teacher training and experience in the sector. Given this, the graduates (90%) have required training within their professional task, either on their own or through the one offered by the company that employs them (Universidad La Salle, 2012).

There are different factors that are related to students’ perception of what they consider to put them at a disadvantage compared to graduates of other universities to get a job. According to the logistic regression model applied to a group of social and economic variables of the students of the
universities of study, it was found that the importance of knowledge of the German language to get employment, the development of the competence on the knowledge of tourism and the The ratings given to the Internet at the university were significant (see table 2), all of which shows its association with the disadvantages of graduates with other universities to get a job.

So it is suggested that the variables that influence to find a good job in the tourism sector are a second language, the development of skills in knowledge of the tourism area, as well as an adequate internet infrastructure. Attending these variables, students consider that they will have a greater opportunity to find employment; clear, without neglecting the other variables analyzed.

**Conclusions**

The students of the degree in tourism perceive that they are developing their professional and transversal competences between regular and good (3.9). It was observed that they fundamentally develop the competences in the area of knowledge of Tourism, Customer Service, and Teamwork. It is necessary, on the other hand, to strengthen the competences in ICT, Events, Languages and Elaboration of Tourist Projects. In particular, the English language as a second language is not adequately promoted in public universities; BUAP does not take advantage of the infrastructure it has in this aspect. The annotation should also be made that there is an imbalance.
in the curriculum that downplays the methodology of research and quantitative methods. This area needs to be strengthened so that in the future students who wish to continue studying have the skills to be able to insert themselves in scientific research through postgraduate studies.

In sum, the professional skills that should be given more attention are the Project Development (emphasis in the UIEP), Quality (BUAP and UIEP), Event Realization (UIEP) and Provision of Tourist Services (UIEP and UMAD). Finally, the command of a foreign language must be strengthened, as is the case of the English language already mentioned, in public universities, and not only in its comprehension, its writing and conversation must also be strengthened. Among the transversal competences, it is necessary to improve the ICT management capacities, paying attention to the computer science, telematics, multimedia, the means of communication and social interaction, and even in the new means of communication that allow to make efficient the work of future graduates. It is an area that is very neglected and needs to be strengthened.

It can be said that the differences between universities are typical of their educational model. The intercultural UIEP promotes human resources to incorporate them into their region of origin and contribute to regional development. On the other hand, the BUAP and UMAD have a different policy in the formation of human capital, since they are directed both to the region of origin and to the satisfaction of the demand of other regions of the country. The differences between universities are their own, apart from the budget they manage, the enrollment they have and the years of experience in the education sector. It is expected that the results of the competences among the students interviewed will be more satisfactory so that they can influence their insertion in the labor market.

References


Salamanca, España: Cátedra de Inserción Profesional Caja Rural Salamanca / Universidad de Salamanca / Servicios de Inserción Profesional Prácticas y Empleo de la Universidad de Salamanca.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rol de Contribución</th>
<th>Autor (es)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conceptualización</td>
<td>José Pedro Juárez Sánchez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metodología</td>
<td>José Pedro Juárez Sánchez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software</td>
<td>María José Contreras López</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validación</td>
<td>José Pedro Juárez Sánchez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Análisis Formal</td>
<td>Benito Ramírez Valverde 50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>José Pedro Juárez Sánchez 50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigación</td>
<td>María José Contreras López</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recursos</td>
<td>María José Contreras López</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curación de datos</td>
<td>María José Contreras López</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escritura - Preparación del borrador original</td>
<td>María José Contreras López</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Escritura - Revisión y edición        | José Pedro Juárez Sánchez 70%  
|                                       | Benito Ramírez Valverde    30%  |
| Visualización                         | José Pedro Juárez Sánchez |
| Supervisión                           | José Pedro Juárez Sánchez |
| Administración de Proyectos           | Benito Ramírez Valverde    |
| Adquisición de fondos                 | Benito Ramírez Valverde    |